Role models or individual consulting: The impact of personalizing micro-entrepreneurship training
ONLINE APPENDIX

By Jeanne Lafortune, Julio Riutort and José Tessada

This online appendix presents tables that were not included in the paper but may be of interest to readers.

Table A.1—Balance

	Role Model			Technical Assistance			
		Mean	Diff (T-C)		Mean	Diff	
Variable	N	Control	T-C	N	Control	T_{Class}-C	$T_{Bus.}$-C
General characteristics:							
Women	1,405	0.91	0.02	1,136	0.93	0.03	0.00
Age	1,374	45	0.42	1,112	45	-0.97	-0.61
Less than HSD	1,521	0.21	-0.03	1,235	0.19	0.01	0.04
High school diploma	1,521	0.50	-0.01	1,235	0.51	-0.02	-0.04
Technical or University	1,521	0.29	0.03	1,235	0.30	0.01	0.00
Socioeconomic:							
Income (M$) last month	1,093	374	31	903	352	40	30
Has business	1,212	0.81	0.01	1,004	0.78	-0.01	0.01
Banking:							
Has bank account	1,237	0.63	0.06**	1,020	0.63	0.02	0.01
Has asked bank for credit	1,225	0.39	0.03	1,011	0.41	0.00	-0.03
Has obtained credit	1,243	0.43	0.06**	1,023	0.45	0.02	0.00
Business:							
Sales (M$) last month	921	471	-36	744	451	24	-147
Costs (M$) last month	792	328	-17	642	360	-44	-144
Profits (M$)	761	180	-17	614	131	74	13
Weekly hours worked at business	1,024	34	1.13	834	32	0.70	2.06
Number of employees last month	576	0.61	0.05	484	0.72	-0.03	-0.31
Wagebill (M$) last month	522	93	16	440	132	-13	-99
Registered with tax authority	1,108	0.34	-0.04*	905	0.33	-0.09**	-0.05
Techniques:							
Marketing actions (0-7)	1,069	2.96	0.14	875	2.92	0.11	0.19
Business analysis (0-6)	1,128	2.72	0.15	922	2.69	0.10	0.04
Book-keeping methods (0-6)	966	0.74	0.10	777	0.83	-0.11	-0.12
Petty cash (M$)	813	160	-42	664	119	30	52
Knows how to compute opp. cost	1,281	2.36	0.00	980	2.35	-0.01	0.11
Knows how to compute revenue	1,246	0.55	0.04	958	0.58	0.01	-0.05
Score on entrance exam (0-7)	1,065	5.17	0.03	836	5.32	-0.19	-0.02
Purchases and financing							
N assets (0-11)	1,582	2.32	0.04	1,132	2.65	-0.03	0.12
Savings	1,017	0.66	0.04	828	0.67	0.01	-0.02
Bank loan	1,017	0.22	0.02	828	0.23	-0.04	-0.01
Family loan	1,017	0.24	0.01	828	0.18	0.09**	0.11***
Government funds	1,017	0.10	-0.02	828	0.12	-0.03	-0.05*
Micro-credit funds	1,017	0.01	0.01*	828	0.00	0.01*	0.01*
Other sources	1,017	0.08	0.03	828	0.13	-0.06**	-0.04
Joint F-test			1.36*		1.29		0.63

Notes: The difference between treatment and control is obtained through a regression which controls for strata. Standard errors robust to heteroscedasticity for technical assistance and clustered at course level for role model in parentheses. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

TABLE A.2—COMPLIANCE WITH RANDOM ASSIGNMENT

	Role model		Technical Assistance					
			In group	In Class		In business		
	N	Compliance	N	Compliance	N	Compliance	N	Compliance
Cohort I (Beca I)	204	0.79	128	0.56	138	0.64	138	0.68
Cohort II (Bono)	124	0.66	.	.	.	.	.	.
Cohort III (Beca II)	181	0.84	120	0.73	129	0.76	132	0.81
Cohort IV (Beca III)	378	0.84	176	0.70	192	0.74	193	0.80
Total	887	0.81	424	0.66	459	0.71	461	0.77

Note: The table reports the number of assigned participants to each group and the level of compliance with the assignment. Cohort II (Bono) is an advanced level so did not receive technical assistance.

Table A.3—Difference in Baseline Characteristics of Those Answering Endline Survey and Those Attriting

Variable	N	Difference
General characteristics:		
Women	1,406	0.01
Age	1,375	2.35***
Secondary incomplete or less	1,523	-0.05***
Secondary	1,523	0.06**
Technical or University	1,523	-0.01
Socioeconomic:		
Income (M$) last month	1,094	14
Has business	1,212	0.00
Banking:		
Has bank account	1,237	0.10***
Has asked bank for credit	1,225	0.01
Has obtained credit	1,243	0.02
Business:		
Sales (M$) last month	923	-32
Costs (M$) last month	793	-13
Profits (M$)	762	31
Weekly hours worked at business	1,025	-1.04
Number of employees last month	575	-0.29
Wagebill (M$) last month	523	-95
Registered with tax authority	1,109	0.00
Techniques:		
Marketing actions (0-7)	1,070	0.05
Business analysis (0-6)	1,129	0.11
Book-keeping methods (0-6)	966	0.02
Petty cash (M$)	814	43*
Knows how to compute opp. cost	1,287	0.01
Knows how to compute revenue	1,252	0.06*
Score on entrance exam (0-7)	1,069	0.31**
Purchases and financing		
N assets (0-11)	1,598	1.02***
Savings	1,018	-0.03
Bank loan	1,018	0.04
Family loan	1,018	0.01
Government funds	1,018	0.01
Micro-credit funds	1,018	-0.00
Other sources	1,018	-0.01

Notes: This table reports the coefficient on a dummy identifying whether or not the individual was found in the endline, in a regression where the outcome variable are baseline characteristics. Regressions control for strata and general individual and business characteristics (except for that group of variables). Standard errors robust to heteroscedasticity for technical assistance and clustered at course level for role model in parentheses. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

TABLE A.4—ATTRITION

	SEG0	SEG1	SEG0	SEG1
Role Model	0.012	0.022		
	(0.032)	(0.023)		
Person. Assist. in class			0.016	0.050
			(0.023)	(0.031)
Person. Assist. in business			0.023	0.022
			(0.023)	(0.031)
Constant	0.790***	0.638***	0.828***	0.665***
	(0.026)	(0.017)	(0.016)	(0.022)
N	1,810	1,810	1,343	1,343

Notes: This table reports the coefficient in a regression of whether or not the individual was found in each of the follow-up interviews against the treatments. Each column is a different regression, which controls for strata. Standard errors robust to heteroscedasticity for technical assistance and clustered at course level for role model in parentheses. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

TABLE A.5—DIFFERENCE IN BASELINE CHARACTERISTICS OF THOSE ANSWERING ENDLINE SURVEY AND THOSE ATTRITING, BY ASSIGNMENT TO TREATMENT

	Role Model		Technical Assistance		
				Diff (T-C)	
Variable	N	Diff (T-C)	N	In class	In bus.
General characteristics:					
Women	1,403	-0.00	1,136	0.09**	0.01
Age	1,372	-1.91	1,112	1.39	1.83
Secondary incomplete or less	1,518	0.09**	1,235	0.06	0.02
Secondary	1,518	-0.13***	1,235	-0.03	0.00
Technical or University	1,518	0.04	1,235	-0.03	-0.02
Socioeconomic:					
Income (M$) last month	1,090	-21	903	-5.05	-120*
Has business	1,208	-0.10*	1,004	-0.00	-0.04
Banking:					
Has bank account	1,233	0.02	1,020	-0.01	-0.07
Has asked bank for credit	1,221	-0.07	1,011	-0.06	-0.06
Has obtained credit	1,239	-0.09	1,023	0.08	0.13
Business:					
Sales (M$) last month	919	-193	744	91	-241
Costs (M$) last month	790	-261	642	392	79
Profits (M$)	759	-7.74	614	-88	-315***
Weekly hours worked at business	1,021	1.23	834	-0.51	-11**
Number of employees last month	573	-0.23	484	0.38	0.45
Wagebill (M$) last month	521	-102	440	122	63
Registered with tax authority	1,105	-0.03	905	-0.29***	-0.30***
Techniques:					
Marketing actions (0-7)	1,066	0.56**	875	-0.39	-0.24
Business analysis (0-6)	1,125	-0.27	922	-0.04	-0.28
Book-keeping methods (0-6)	963	-0.20	777	-0.45*	-0.36*
Petty cash (M$)	810	-64	664	-39	18
Knows how to compute opp. cost	1,281	0.23**	980	-0.02	-0.30
Knows how to compute revenue	1,246	0.08	958	-0.04	0.10
Score on entrance exam (0-7)	1,062	0.15	836	-0.60**	-0.32
Purchases and financing					
N assets (0-11)	1,579	-0.00	1,131	-0.19	-0.42
Savings	1,014	0.11	828	0.06	0.03
Bank loan	1,014	-0.04	828	-0.07	-0.06
Family loan	1,014	-0.11	828	0.06	-0.07
Government funds	1,014	0.01	828	0.13**	0.07
Micro-credit funds	1,014	0.00	828	0.01	-0.00
Other sources	1,014	0.00	828	0.06	-0.00

Notes: This table reports the coefficient in a regression of baseline characteristics against the treatments interacted with an indicator variable which indicates that the individual was found in the follow-up survey. Each cell is a different regression, which controls for strata. Standard errors robust to heteroscedasticity for technical assistance and clustered at course level for role model in parentheses. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

TABLE A.6—DIFFERENTIAL ATTRITION BY TREATMENT, DEPENDING ON OUTCOME

Variables	Role Model	Technical Assistance	
		In class	In bus.
Socioeconomic:			
Income per capita (M$)	0.039*	0.052	0.049
	(0.021)	(0.033)	(0.033)
Main household income source	0.030	0.059*	0.042
	(0.023)	(0.032)	(0.032)
Has a business	0.023	0.050	0.037
	(0.022)	(0.032)	(0.032)
Entrepreneurship:			
Is in a different sector	0.010	0.074**	0.046
	(0.022)	(0.031)	(0.031)
Operates from a different location	0.014	0.061**	0.032
	(0.022)	(0.031)	(0.031)
Hours per week	0.019	0.041	0.033
	(0.021)	(0.032)	(0.032)
Registered with tax authority	0.026	0.049	0.030
	(0.023)	(0.032)	(0.032)
Number of workers last month	0.030	0.042	0.015
	(0.023)	(0.032)	(0.032)
Wage bill (M$) last month	0.027	0.055*	0.015
	(0.023)	(0.033)	(0.033)
Sales (M$) last month	0.043*	0.062*	0.045
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.033)
Costs (M$) last month	0.045**	0.049	0.042
	(0.022)	(0.033)	(0.033)
Profits (M$) last month	0.043*	0.061*	0.048
	(0.022)	(0.033)	(0.033)
Variance in sales in last year	0.030	0.038	0.038
	(0.025)	(0.032)	(0.032)
Credit and banking:			
Has a bank account	0.034	0.060*	0.043
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Has credit	0.032	0.057*	0.044
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Obtained bank credit (last 6 months)	0.017	0.077**	0.069**
	(0.022)	(0.033)	(0.033)
Management practices:			
Marketing actions (0-7)	0.032	0.056*	0.038
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Business analysis (0-6)	0.033	0.059*	0.048
	(0.026)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Petty cash (M$)	0.016	0.070**	0.042
	(0.024)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Knows how to compute opp. cost	0.027	0.053	0.028
	(0.023)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Knows how to compute revenue	0.027	0.053	0.028
	(0.023)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Financing of inputs:			
Savings	0.030	0.044	0.038
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Bank loan	0.031	0.053	0.038
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Family loan	0.030	0.050	0.038
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Government funds	0.030	0.053	0.038
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.032)
Micro-credit funds	0.030	0.053	0.038
	(0.025)	(0.033)	(0.032)

Notes: This table reports the coefficient in a regression of whether or not the individual provided an answer to each follow-up outcomes against the treatments. Each cell is a different regression, which controls for strata. Standard errors robust to heteroscedasticity for technical assistance and clustered at course level for role model in parentheses. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

Table A.7—Difference between location of technical assistance

Variables	N	F-test
Socioeconomic:		
Income per capita (M$)	773	0.53
Main household income source	878	1.66
Has business	892	0.11
Entrepreneurship:		
Is in a different sector	529	1.56
Operates from a different location	542	0.34
Hours per week	873	0.19
Registered with tax authority	877	0.00
Number of workers (last month)	853	0.43
Wagebill (M$) last month	814	0.69
Sales (M$) last month	622	1.88
Costs (M$) last month	575	2.44
Profits (M$) last month	567	0.73
Variance in sales in last year	638	1.45
Credit and banking:		
Has a bank account	680	1.20
Has credit	682	0.33
Obtained bank credit (last 6 months)	564	0.85
Management practices:		
Marketing actions (0-7)	688	1.14
Business analysis (0-6)	685	1.01
Petty cash (M$)	613	0.21
Knows how to compute opp. cost	841	0.00
Knows how to compute revenue	841	5.14**
Financing of inputs:		
Savings	670	0.66
Bank loan	669	0.03
Family loan	670	0.00
Government funds	670	1.19
Micro-credit funds	670	0.09
Knowledge at the end of the class:		
Knows how to compute opp. cost	904	0.29
Knows how to compute revenue	904	0.93
Score in exit exam (0-7)	745	0.37
Behaviors at the end of the class:		
Applied for seed fund	1,034	0.34
N assets (0-11)	930	0.56
Desired sales growth (%)	723	1.92

Notes: Table presents the F-test of the equality of the coefficients on technical assistance in class and in business. Regressions control for strata, baseline (when available) and general individual and business characteristics. Standard errors robust to heteroscedasticity for technical assistance. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

Table A.8—Randomization inference p-values

Socioeconomic:	
Income per capita (M$)	0.050**
Main household income source	0.758
Has business	0.074*
Entrepreneurship:	
Is in a different sector	0.411
Operates from a different location	0.106
Hours per week	0.116
Registered with tax authority	0.038**
Number of workers (last month)	0.998
Wagebill (M$) last month	0.998
Sales (M$) last month	0.164
Costs (M$) last month	0.880
Profits (M$) last month	0.004***
Variance in sales in last year	0.355
Credit and banking:	
Has a bank account	0.752
Has credit	0.836
Obtained bank credit (last 6 months)	0.998
Management practices:	
Marketing actions (0-7)	0.625
Business analysis (0-6)	0.998
Petty cash (M$)	0.719
Knows how to compute opp. cost	0.808
Knows how to compute revenue	0.840
Financing of inputs:	
Savings	0.329
Bank loan	0.998
Family loan	0.998
Government funds	0.998
Micro-credit funds	0.519

Notes: This table reports the two-sided p-values of the t-test for the null hypothesis that being assigned to the role model had no impact based on the empirical distribution of t-tests from 500 estimations where we randomly assigned treatment to 34 clusters of our 66 classes. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

Table A.9—Bounds of impact of role-model

Variable	Estimate	Lower bound	Upper bound
Socioeconomic:			
Income per capita (M$)	17.09**	3.10	21.12***
Main household income source	0.01	-0.00	0.03
Has business	0.03*	0.03*	0.05***
Entrepreneurship:			
Change Sector	0.03	0.02	0.04
Operates from a different location	0.06*	0.04	0.07**
Hours per week	1.65	0.20	2.32**
Registered with tax authority	0.06**	0.04*	0.07***
Number of workers (last month)	-0.00	-0.12***	0.01
Wagebill (M$) last month	-10.21	-24.17***	-9.74
Sales (M$) last month	92.71*	-50.99	107.24**
Costs (M$) last month	7.11	-81.31**	11.50
Profits	96.17***	-4.34	114.16***
Variance in sales in last year	0.02	0.00	0.04**
Credit and banking:			
Has a bank account	0.01	0.00	0.03
Has credit	0.01	-0.02	0.01
Obtained bank credit (last 6 months)	-0.02	-0.03**	-0.02

Notes: This table reports the coefficient in a regression of each outcome against the random assignment to a role model. The first column reports the estimated coefficient in the full sample. The second column shows the coefficient in a regression where the differential attrition between those assigned to the treatment and those not assigned is removed from the top of the distribution of the outcome. The third column shows the coefficient in a regression where the differential attrition between those assigned to the treatment and those not assigned is removed from the bottom of the distribution of the outcome. Each cell is a different regression, which controls for strata, baseline (when available) and general individual and business characteristics. Standard errors clustered at course level for role model. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

Table A.10—Impact on Evaluation of Technical Assistance

Variables	N	In class	In bus.
Helped me to identify strengths and weaknesses	1,004	0.11	0.05
		(0.07)	(0.07)
Helped me to identify possible solutions	1,009	0.05	0.02
		(0.06)	(0.06)
Helped me to introduce changes in business management	985	0.02	-0.02
		(0.07)	(0.07)
Was useful	1,007	0.07	-0.00
		(0.07)	(0.07)
Length was insufficient	1,010	-0.00	0.03
		(0.02)	(0.02)
Length was adequate	1,010	-0.02	-0.05*
		(0.03)	(0.03)
Length was excessive	1,010	0.02	0.02
		(0.02)	(0.02)

Notes: Table presents the coefficient on treatment variables in regression equation (1). Each row represents one regression. Regressions control for strata and general individual and business characteristics. Standard errors robust to heteroscedasticity for technical assistance and clustered at course level for role model in parentheses. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.

Table A.11—Evaluation of Role Model by participants

The Role Model...	N	Not At All	Little	Enough	A Lot
Motivated to be persistent	563	0.02	0.03	0.36	0.58
Communicated the value of being an entrepreneur	560	0.03	0.05	0.42	0.51
Motivated to apply things learnt on the course	571	0.03	0.05	0.43	0.49
Was close to people	565	0.02	0.05	0.53	0.40
Gave useful information	549	0.07	0.12	0.47	0.34

Notes: This table reports the frequency of answers of participants in Role Model groups to survey questions.

Table A.12—IV results: Interactions

	Income per capita (M$)	Has business	Registered with tax authority
	Panel A: By Having a Business		
Role Model*No Business	-47.492**	-0.009	-0.137*
	(20.188)	(0.078)	(0.071)
Person. Assist.*No Business	-56.235*	0.173	-0.016
	(30.491)	(0.123)	(0.103)
	Panel B: By Business Age		
Role Model*Old Business	-32.999	-0.126*	-0.172*
	(27.716)	(0.074)	(0.093)
Person. Assist.*Old Business	-36.266	0.325**	-0.068
	(44.345)	(0.137)	(0.153)
	Panel C: By Education		
Role Model*High School or More	5.466	-0.105	-0.046
	(15.871)	(0.070)	(0.084)
Person. Assist.*High School or More	19.342	0.178**	0.203*
	(25.548)	(0.081)	(0.119)

Notes: Table presents the coefficient on treatment variables interacted with a given characteristic instrumented for the interaction of the random assignment with the same given characteristic. Each cell represents one regression where the outcome variable is the title of the column. Regressions control for main intervention effect, strata, baseline (when available) and general individual and business characteristics (including the one used for the interaction). Standard errors robust to heteroscedasticity for technical assistance and clustered at course level for role model in parentheses. $*p < 0.1, **p < 0.05, ***p < 0.01$.