

Online Appendix for  
“Similarity Nash Equilibria in Statistical Games”  
by Rossella Argenziano and Itzhak Gilboa

**a) Calculation of  $b(L, W, l, 1.5) > 0$ .**

We evaluate the function  $b(L, W, l, \omega)$  at  $\omega = 1.5$  and find the following expression:

$$\frac{L * g(L, W, l)}{(-1 + L + W)^2(L + 2lL + 2lW)^2(L + 2lL + 2L^2 + 2lW + 2LW)^2}$$

where  $g(L, W, l)$  can be expressed as a polynomial in  $W$  :

$$\begin{aligned} & g(L, W, l) \\ = & (32l^4 + 64l^3L + 32l^2L^2)W^5 \\ & + 16l [2L^3 + l^3(8L - 1) + 2l^2L(1 + 8L) + lL^2(5 + 8L)] W^4 \\ & + 4lL [12l^3(4L - 1) + 3lL^2(21 + 16L) + L^2(4 + 27L) + 8l^2(-1 + 3L + 12L^2)] W^3 \\ & + 2L^2 \left[ \begin{array}{l} -3(L - 2)L^2 + 8l^4(8L - 3) + 16l^3(-2 + 3L + 8L^2) + \\ 2l^2(-6 - 6L + 69L^2 + 32L^3) + 2lL(6 - L + 33L^2) \end{array} \right] W^2 \\ & + \left[ \begin{array}{l} 16l^4(2L - 1) + 3L(2 + 5L - 4L^2) + 32l^3(-1 + L + 2L^2) \\ + 4l^2(-3 - 12L + 29L^2 + 8L^3) + 4l(-6 + 15L - 14L^2 + 17L^3) \end{array} \right] L^3W \\ & - 3L^4(L - 1)^2(3 + 2L) + 12l^2L^4(L - 1)^2 + 12lL^4(L - 1)^3 \end{aligned}$$

Notice that for  $W, L > 2$  and  $l > 0$  the terms multiplying  $W^5$ ,  $W^4$ , and  $W^3$  are positive. The terms multiplying  $W^2$  and  $L^3W$  and the constant are polynomials in  $l$ . For  $l > 0$ , all three are increasing in  $l$ , as the coefficients of the positive powers of  $l$  are positive. Moreover, all three are positive when evaluated at  $l = 1$ , hence for all  $l > 1$  as well. . In particular, the coefficient of  $W^2$  evaluated at  $l = 1$  is equal to  $-68 + 112L + 270L^2 + 127L^3 > 0$ . The coefficient of  $L^3W$  evaluated at  $l = 1$  is equal to  $-84 + 82L + 139L^2 + 88L^3 > 0$ . Finally, the constant evaluated at  $l = 1$  is equal to  $3L^4(2L - 3)(L - 1)^2 > 0$ .

We have proved that  $g(L, W, l) > 0$ . Since  $\frac{L}{(-1+L+W)^2(L+2lL+2lW)^2(L+2lL+2L^2+2lW+2LW)^2} > 0$ , this concludes the proof.

**b) Calculation of  $b(L, W, l, -0.5) > 0$  for  $l > 1$  and  $\left[\frac{lW}{L}\right] \geq 1$ .**

We evaluate the function  $b(L, W, l, \omega)$  at  $\omega = -0.5$  and find the following

expression:

$$\frac{-L * h(L, W, l)}{(-1 + L + W)^2(-3L + 2lL + 2lW)^2(-3L + 2lL + 2L^2 + 2lW + 2LW)^2}$$

where  $h(L, W, l)$  can be expressed as a polynomial in  $L$  :

$$\begin{aligned} & h(L, W, l) \\ = & (20l - 18) L^7 + [-4l^2(8W - 5) + l(-76 + 92W) + 45 - 36W] L^6 \\ & + [-36 + 4(23 - 10l)l + (81 - 4l(90 + l(-75 + 16l)))]W - 2(9 - 78l + 64l^2)W^2] L^5 \\ & + \left[ \begin{array}{l} 9 - 36l + 20l^2 + (-54 + 388l - 528l^2 + 224l^3 - 32l^4)W \\ + (36 - 492l + 780l^2 - 256l^3)W^2 + (116l - 192l^2)W^3 \end{array} \right] L^4 \\ & + \left[ \begin{array}{l} -4l(18 - 43l + 24l^2 - 4l^3) - 4l(-74 + 234l - 168l^2 + 32l^3)W \\ -4l(52 - 185l + 96l^2)W^2 - 4l(32l - 8)W^3 \end{array} \right] WL^3 \\ & - 8l^2W^2 [-19 + 56W - 30W^2 + 4W^3 + l^2(-6 + 24W) + l(24 - 84W + 32W^2)] L^2 \\ & - 16l^3W^3 [6 - 3l + (8l - 14)W + 4W^2] L - 16l^4W^4(2W - 1) \end{aligned}$$

In what follows, we prove that  $h(L, W, l) < 0$  for all  $l > 0$  and  $L, W > 2$ . The constant term is negative. The coefficient of  $L$  is negative because it is the product of a negative term and a quadratic expression in  $W$  with a positive coefficient on the square which is positive and increasing at  $W = 2$ , hence for any larger  $W$  too. Similarly, the coefficient of  $L^2$  is negative because it is the product of a negative term and a quadratic expression in  $l$  with a positive coefficient on the square which is positive and increasing at  $l = 2$ , hence for any larger  $l$  too.

The coefficient of  $L^3$  is the product of  $W$ , which is positive, and a third degree polynomial in  $W$  which can be shown to be negative in the relevant range. In particular, the polynomial has a negative coefficient on the third and second power. At  $W = 2$ , this polynomial is equal to  $-56l + 236l^2 - 288l^3 - 240l^4$  which is negative for all  $l > 1$ . Moreover, its derivative at  $W = 2$  is equal to  $-152l + 488l^2 - 864l^3 - 128l^4$  which is also negative for all  $l > 1$ . Finally, the fact that this derivative is negative  $W = 2$  implies that it is also negative for all values of  $W > 2$ , because the negative coefficients on the third and second powers of  $W$  guarantee that the function is concave in  $W$  for positive  $W$ .

The coefficient of  $L^4$  is a third degree polynomial in  $W$  which can be shown

to be negative in the relevant range ( $l > 1$ ,  $W > 2$ ). The polynomial has a negative coefficient on the third power. Evaluated at  $W = 2$ , it takes value  $45 - 300l + 548l^2 - 576l^3 - 64l^4 < 0$  for all  $l > 1$ . Moreover, its derivative w.r.t.  $W$  evaluated at  $W = 2$  is equal to  $90 - 188l + 288l^2 - 800l^3 - 32l^4$  which is also negative for all  $l > 1$ . Finally, its second derivative w.r.t.  $W$  is equal to  $-8(-9 + 123l - 195l^2 + 64l^3 + (144l - 87)lW)$  which is negative at  $W = 2$  and decreasing in  $W$  for all positive values of  $W$ .

The coefficient of  $L^5$  is a quadratic function of  $W$  with a negative coefficient on the square, which is negative and decreasing at  $W = 3$ , hence negative for all larger values of  $W$  too. The coefficient of  $L^6$  is a quadratic function of  $l$  with a negative coefficient on the square, which is positive for  $l = 2$  and negative for all larger values of  $l$ . The coefficient of  $L^7$  is positive.

Since the coefficient  $L^7$  is positive, and we want to prove that the whole polynomial in  $L$  is negative, we prove that the sum of the terms in  $L^7$  and  $L^5$  is negative.

First, notice that the condition  $\frac{lW}{L} \geq \frac{1}{2}$  implies that  $L \leq 2lW$ , which in turn implies:

$$(20l - 18) L^7 < 4(20l - 18) L^5 l^2 W^2$$

which in turn implies that

$$\begin{aligned} & (20l - 18) L^7 + \left[ \begin{array}{c} -36 + 4(23 - 10l)l \\ +(81 - 4l(90 + l(-75 + 16l)))W - 2(9 - 78l + 64l^2)W^2 \end{array} \right] L^5 \\ < & 4(20l - 18) L^5 l^2 W^2 + \left[ \begin{array}{c} -36 + 4(23 - 10l)l \\ +(81 - 4l(90 + l(-75 + 16l)))W - 2(9 - 78l + 64l^2)W^2 \end{array} \right] L^5 \\ = & \left[ \begin{array}{c} (80l - 72) l^2 W^2 - 36 + 4(23 - 10l)l \\ +(81 - 4l(90 + l(-75 + 16l)))W - 2(9 - 78l + 64l^2)W^2 \end{array} \right] L^5 \\ = & [(92l - 40l^2 - 36) + (300l^2 - 64l^3 - 360l + 81)W + (-128l^2 + 236l - 90)W^2] L^5 \end{aligned}$$

The last expression is a quadratic in  $W$  which is negative for all  $W > 2$ . In particular, it has a negative coefficient on the square, hence it is concave. Evaluated at  $W = 2$  it is equal to  $-128l^3 + 48l^2 + 316l - 234 < 0$  for all  $l > 1$ . Moreover, its derivative evaluated at  $W = 2$  is equal to  $-64l^3 - 212l^2 + 584l - 279 < 0$  for all  $l > 1$ .

To conclude the proof that the whole polynomial in  $L$  is negative, we still need to address the fact that the coefficient of  $L^6$  is positive at  $l = 2$ .

In particular, we do so by proving that the sum of the terms in  $L^6$  and  $L^4$  is negative at  $l = 2$ . First, notice that the condition  $\frac{lW}{L} \geq \frac{1}{2}$  implies that  $L \leq 2lW$ , which in turn implies:

$$\begin{aligned} & [-4l^2(8W - 5) + l(-76 + 92W) + 45 - 36W] /_{l=2} L^6 \\ & < 4 [-4l^2(8W - 5) + l(-76 + 92W) + 45 - 36W] /_{l=2} L^4 l^2 W^2 \end{aligned}$$

which in turn implies that

$$\begin{aligned} & = [-4l^2(8W - 5) + l(-76 + 92W) + 45 - 36W] /_{l=2} L^6 \\ & \quad + L^4 \left[ \begin{aligned} & 9 - 36l + 20l^2 + (-54 + 388l - 528l^2 + 224l^3 - 32l^4)W \\ & + (36 - 492l + 780l^2 - 256l^3)W^2 + (116l - 192l^2)W^3 \end{aligned} \right] /_{l=2} \\ & < 4 [-4l^2(8W - 5) + l(-76 + 92W) + 45 - 36W] /_{l=2} L^4 l^2 W^2 \\ & \quad + L^4 \left[ \begin{aligned} & 9 - 36l + 20l^2 + (-54 + 388l - 528l^2 + 224l^3 - 32l^4)W \\ & + (36 - 492l + 780l^2 - 256l^3)W^2 + (116l - 192l^2)W^3 \end{aligned} \right] /_{l=2} \\ & = (-216W^3 - 308W^2 - 110W + 17) L^4 < 0 \text{ for all } W > 2. \end{aligned}$$

This concludes the proof that  $b(L, W, l, -0.5) > 0$  for  $l > 1$ .

**Calculation of  $b(L, W, l, 0.5) > 0$  for  $l > 1$  and  $[\frac{lW}{L}] = 0$ .**

We evaluate the function  $b(L, W, l, \omega)$  at  $\omega = 0.5$  and find the following expression:

$$\frac{L * \eta(L, W, l)}{(L + W - 1)^2 (-L + 2LW + 2lW + 2Ll + 2L^2) (-L + 2lW + 2Ll)}$$

where  $\eta(L, W, l)$  can be expressed as a polynomial in  $L$  : in which all the coefficients, as well as the constant, are positive:

$$\begin{aligned}
& \eta(L, W, l) \\
= & (12l - 2) L^7 + [W(4l - 4) + l(32W - 28) + 32l^2W + 12l^2 + 3] L^6 \\
& + \left[ \begin{array}{l} 64l^3W + l^2W(100W - 44) + l^2(28W^2 - 24) \\ + W^2(6l - 2) + lW(30W - 72) + 20l + 7W \end{array} \right] L^5 \\
& + \left[ \begin{array}{l} 6l^4W + l^3W(156W - 96) + l^2W^2(192W - 204) + 16l^2W(l^2 - 1) + 12lW^3 \\ + lW^2(100l^2 - 60) + (44lW - 1) + l(12l - 4) + 2W(2W - 1) \end{array} \right] L^4 \\
& + \left[ \begin{array}{l} l^4W(128W - 16) + l^3W^2(300W - 288) + 32l^3W + l^2W^3(128W - 228) \\ + 40l^2W^2 + 20l^2W + lW^3(84l^2 - 16) + lW(24W - 8) \end{array} \right] L^3 \\
& + \left[ \begin{array}{l} l^4W^2(192W - 48) + l^2W^4(156l - 80) + l^3W^3(100W - 288) + 64l^3W^2 \\ + 32l^2W^5 + 32l^2W^3 + 8l^2W^2 \end{array} \right] L^2 \\
& + [l^4W^3(128W - 48) + l^3W^4(64W - 96) + 32l^3W^3] L + 16l^4W^4(2W - 1)
\end{aligned}$$

**c) Calculation of  $\frac{\partial b(L, W, l, \omega)}{\partial \omega} < 0$  for all  $\omega \geq -\frac{W}{L}$  for the case  $l = 1$**

For  $l = 1$ , the  $b(L, W, l, \omega)$  function and its derivative with respect to  $\omega$  are

$$\begin{aligned}
b(L, W, 1, \omega) &= \frac{LW(L + W)}{(L + W - 1)^2} + \frac{L + W + L\omega}{W + L\omega} \\
&- \frac{(1 + L)(W + LW + L\omega)(L + L^2 + W + LW + L\omega)}{(L^2 + W + LW + L\omega)^2}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\frac{\partial b(L, W, 1, \omega)}{\partial \omega} = \frac{-L^3\phi(L, W, \omega)}{(W + L\omega)^2(L^2 + W + LW + L\omega)^3}$$

where  $\phi(L, W, \omega)$  is the following cubic expression in  $\omega$  in which all the coefficients, including the constant, are positive.

$$\begin{aligned}
& \phi(L, W, \omega) \\
= & L^5 + 3L^3W + 3L^4W + 4LW^2 + 8L^2W^2 + 4L^3W^2 + 2W^3 + 4LW^3 + 2L^2W^3 \\
& + \omega(3L^4 + 8L^2W + 10L^3W + 2L^4W + 4LW^2 + 6L^2W^2 + 2L^3W^2) \\
& + \omega^2(4L^3 + 2L^4 + L^5 + 2L^2W + 3L^3W + L^4W) + \omega^3L^4
\end{aligned}$$

The sign of the coefficients guarantees that the expression is positive, for all  $\omega \geq 0$ . To examine the sign of  $\phi(L, W, \omega)$  for  $w \in [-\frac{W}{L}, 0)$ , notice that:

$$\text{a) } \phi(L, W, -\frac{W}{L}) = L^2(L+W)^3 > 0$$

$$\text{b) } \phi(L, W, 0) = L^5 + 3L^3W + 3L^4W + 4LW^2 + 8L^2W^2 + 4L^3W^2 + 2W^3 + 4LW^3 + 2L^2W^3 > 0$$

c)

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \phi(L, W, \omega)}{\partial \omega} &= (3L^4 + 8L^2W + 10L^3W + 2L^4W + 4LW^2 + 6L^2W^2 + 2L^3W^2) \\ &\quad + 2\omega(4L^3 + 2L^4 + L^5 + 2L^2W + 3L^3W + L^4W) + 3L^4\omega^2 \\ &\geq (3L^4 + 8L^2W + 10L^3W + 2L^4W + 4LW^2 + 6L^2W^2 + 2L^3W^2) \\ &\quad + 2\omega(4L^3 + 2L^4 + L^5 + 2L^2W + 3L^3W + L^4W) \\ &> (3L^4 + 8L^2W + 10L^3W + 2L^4W + 4LW^2 + 6L^2W^2 + 2L^3W^2) \\ &\quad - 2\frac{W}{L}(4L^3 + 2L^4 + L^5 + 2L^2W + 3L^3W + L^4W) \\ &= 3L^3(L + 2W) > 0 \end{aligned}$$

where the first inequality follows from the fact that  $3L^4\omega^2 \geq 0$  and the second from the fact that  $\omega > -\frac{W}{L}$ .

Hence we can conclude that  $\phi(L, W, \omega)$  is positive and increasing in the whole interval  $(-\frac{W}{L}, 0)$ , hence the function  $b(L, W, 1, \omega)$  is decreasing for all  $\omega > -\frac{W}{L}$ .