Online Appendix

"Migration on the Rise, a Paradigm in Decline: The Last Half-Century of Global Mobility"

Michael A. Clemens — January 2022

A1 Additional sources for the evidence in the main text

The strict page limits for the main text required any extensive citation of the relevant literature to be moved to this Appendix. This section provides further citations of the crucial evidence base.

- Global migrant prevalence from IOM (2022).
- Evidence that greater flows of goods and capital between countries have caused more migration between them, in Campaniello (2014); Bang and MacDermott (2019). Evidence that specialized exchange continues to require in-person interaction, in Clemens (2013).
- Evidence that emigration from poor countries has typically coincided with the arrival of sustained economic growth, in Hatton and Williamson (1998); Williamson (2006, 2015); Clemens (2020).
- Evidence that the relative absence of African migrants in rich countries is a sign of Africa's relative poverty, not its relative wealth, in Hatton and Williamson (2011); Hanson and McIntosh (2016).
- Hatton and Williamson (2005, 179) attribute the new 1920s immigration restrictions across the New World to politically-powerful organized labor fearing competition from immigrants with decreasingly specialized skill.
- Evidence that Mexicans faced limited policy barriers to US immigration before 1930, in Kosack and Ward (2014); Lee et al. (2020).
- Evidence that the half-century of closure that preceded 1970 caused *lower* native incomes, in Tabellini (2019); Sequeira et al. (2019); Abramitzky et al. (2022).
- On the lack of evidence that remittances cause short-run growth, see Clemens and McKenzie (2018). For additional evidence of the effect of remittances on long-run human capital investment, see Dinkelman and Mariotti (2016).
- Evidence that immigration barriers before 1970 worked poorly to induce positive selection: Chinese exclusion in the U.S. 1882–1965, explicitly designed to encourage positive selection, reduced the average skill level of Chinese immigrants—because it deterred talented workers sensitive to denigration; see Chen (2015).
- Additional evidence of the effect of migrants on trade flows in Markusen (1983); Rauch (1999); Aleksynska and Peri (2014); Bahar and Rapoport (2018).
- Additional evidence of the effect of migrants on capital flows in Javorcik et al. (2011); Gollin and Lange (2013); Hernandez (2014); Burchardi et al. (2018); Mayda et al. (2019).
- Additional evidence that little of the trend in U.S. income inequality can be explained by immigrant wage competition, in Goldin et al. (2007).
- Evidence that average real incomes did not substantially diverge between U.S. and Mexico from the 1970s to the 2010s: The ratio of average real income per capita at purchasing-power parity was 3.3 in both 1976 and 2016 (Bolt et al., 2018).

A2 Rise in global migration prevalence since 1910

Between 1910 and 2022, the number of people living outside their country of birth or nationality rose from around 36 million to 281 million (Ferenczi (1937, 28), an increase of 7.8 times; IOM 2022, 40) that is, from 2.0% to 3.6% of all people (using the 1910 world population estimate of 1.77bn from Klein Goldewijk et al. 2011). This change does not account for the rising number of countries, from 97 counted by Ferenczi in 1910 to 193 United Nations member states in 2022; but even the sharp rise to 166 countries by 1930 was accompanied with a *fall* to 29 million global migrants. Since 1930, the largest bias from country creation arose from the partition of the Soviet Union and South Asia, which overnight created (respectively) about 30 million and 8 million additional people living outside their (former) country of birth UNDESA (2004, vii, 23). Even adjusting for these biases, a conservative estimate is that the number of international migrants rose by a factor of more than six between 1910 and 2022.

A3 The changing prevalence and composition of U.S. immigrants since 1850

From Gibson and Jung (2006) and Ruggles et al. (2021, ACS 2010 5yr & 2019 1yr); U.S. population from Haines and Sutch (2003) 1850–2000 and from U.S. Census Bureau 2010–2019. 'Core Europe' is all of the British Isles, Germany, France (with Monaco), Benelux, and Switzerland (with Lichtenstein). 'Canada' includes negligible number from Bermuda, Greenland, and Miquelon.

A4 Decomposition of the rise of emigration prevalence to rich countries since 1970

Native emigration prevalence is the fraction of people born in each country who reside in a high-income country (as defined by the World Bank) that is not their country of birth. Panel (a) shows a cross-section of 154 countries in 1970 in a local-linear regression with bandwidth 0.8 natural log points and Epanechnikov kernel, 95% confidence interval in gray. A linear regression with the data in Figure 2 panel (a) yields slope 0.0120 (robust s.e. 0.002774) and constant term −0.07729 (robust s.e. 0.02165). Panel (b) uses that regression to predict emigration prevalence from each origin using actual economic growth at the origin, summing across all origins to yield a global stock of predicted emigrants in rich countries, and compares it to the true stock in each year. Data from Clemens (2020).

A5 Decomposition of Mexico-U.S. migration 1900–2019

Predicted migrants due to "age and literacy push" in year t are $\hat{m}_t = \sum_a \sum_\ell \bar{\phi}^{1930}_{a,\ell} n^t_{a,\ell}$ where $n^t_{a,\ell}$ is the number of Mexican-born residing in either Mexico or the United States in year t with age $a \in \{10\text{–}14, 15\text{–}19, 20\text{–}24, \ldots, 80\text{–}84, 85+\}$ and literacy $\ell \in \{0, 1\}$, and $\bar{\phi}^{1930}_{a,\ell}$ is the fraction of each age-by-literacy group that was residing in the United States in 1930. Predicted migrants due to "age push" are $\hat{m}_t = \sum_a \bar{\phi}^{1930}_{a} n^t_{a}$. Data on Mexican-born in Mexico from INEGI *Estadísticas Históricas de México 2014* (1930–2010), *Censo de Población y Vivienda 2020*, and MPC (2020) (literacy by age group 1930–1950 estimated by literacy rate among corresponding age cohort in 1960); U.S. data from Ruggles et al. (2021). 'Literacy' in U.S. census post-1930 defined as in the Mexican census: attainment of *any* primary schooling.

References

Abramitzky, Ran, Philipp Ager, Leah Platt Boustan, Elior Cohen, and Casper W Hansen, "The effects of immigration on the economy: Lessons from the 1920s border closure," 2022, *forthcoming*.

Aleksynska, Mariya and Giovanni Peri, "Isolating the Network Effect of Immigrants on Trade," *The World Economy*, 2014, *37* (3), 434–455.

Bahar, Dany and Hillel Rapoport, "Migration, knowledge diffusion and the comparative advantage of nations," *Economic Journal*, 2018, *128* (612), F273–F305.

Bang, James T. and Raymond MacDermott, "Does FDI Attract Immigrants? An Empirical Gravity Model Approach," *International Migration Review*, 2019, *53* (1), 237–253.

Bolt, Jutta, Robert Inklaar, Herman de Jong, and Jan Luiten van Zanden, "Rebasing 'Maddison': New income comparisons and the shape of long-run economic development," Maddison Project Working paper 10. Groningen Growth and Development Centre, Faculty of Economics and Business. University of Groningen 2018.

Burchardi, Konrad B, Thomas Chaney, and Tarek A Hassan, "Migrants, Ancestors, and Foreign Investments," *The Review of Economic Studies*, 08 2018, *86* (4), 1448–1486.

Campaniello, Nadia, "The causal effect of trade on migration: Evidence from countries of the Euro-Mediterranean partnership," *Labour Economics*, 2014, *30*, 223–233.

Chen, Joyce J., "The Impact of Skill-Based Immigration Restrictions: The Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882," *Journal of Human Capital*, 2015, *9* (3), 298–328.

Clemens, Michael A, "Why Do Programmers Earn More in Houston Than Hyderabad? Evidence from Randomized Processing of US Visas," *American Economic Review Papers & Proceedings*, May 2013, *103* (3), 198–202.

__ , "The emigration life cycle: How development shapes emigration from poor countries," IZA Discussion Paper 2020.

__ **and David McKenzie**, "Why don't remittances appear to affect growth?," *Economic Journal*, 2018, *128* (612), F179–F209.

Dinkelman, Taryn and Martine Mariotti, "The Long-Run Effects of Labor Migration on Human Capital Formation in Communities of Origin," *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, October 2016, *8* (4), 1–35.

Ferenczi, Imre, *World Statistics of Aliens: A Comparative Study of Census Returns 1910–1920–1930*, London: International Labour Office (League of Nations), 1937.

Gibson, Campbell and Kay Jung, "Historical Census Statistics on the Foreign-Born Population of the United States: 1850–2000," Population Division Working Paper No. 81. Washington, DC: US Census Bureau 2006.

Goldewijk, Kees Klein, Arthur Beusen, Gerard van Drecht, and Martine de Vos, "The HYDE 3.1 spatially explicit database of human-induced global land-use change over the past 12,000 years," *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, 2011, *20* (1), 73–86.

Goldin, Claudia, Lawrence F Katz et al., "Long-Run Changes in the Wage Structure: Narrowing, Widening, Polarizing," *Brookings Papers on Economic Activity*, 2007, *38* (2), 135–168.

Gollin, Douglas and Fabian Lange, "Equipping immigrants: migration flows and capital movements in small open economies," *Review of World Economics*, 2013, *149* (4), 749–777.

Haines, Michael R. and Richard Sutch, "Table Aa6-8, Population: 1790–2000 [Annual estimates]," in Susan B. Carter et al., eds., *Historical Statistics of the United States: Millennial Edition Online*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Hanson, Gordon H and Craig McIntosh, "Is the Mediterranean the New Rio Grande? US and EU immigration pressures in the long run," *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 2016, *30* (4), 57–82.

Hatton, Timothy J and Jeffrey G Williamson, *The Age of Mass Migration: Causes and Economic Impact*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

__ **and** __ , *Global migration and the world economy: Two centuries of policy and performance*, Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2005.

__ **and** __ , "Are third world emigration forces abating?," *World Development*, 2011, *39* (1), 20–32.

Hernandez, Exequiel, "Finding a Home away from Home: Effects of Immigrants on Firms? Foreign Location Choice and Performance," *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 2014, *59* (1), 73–108.

IOM, *World Migration Report 2022*, Geneva: International Organization for Migration, 2022.

Javorcik, Beata S., Çağlar Özden, Mariana Spatareanu, and Cristina Neagu, "Migrant networks and foreign direct investment," *Journal of Development Economics*, 2011, *94* (2), 231–241.

Kosack, Edward and Zachary Ward, "Who Crossed the Border? Self-Selection of Mexican Migrants in the Early Twentieth Century," *The Journal of Economic History*, 2014, *74* (4), 1015–1044.

Lee, Jongkwan, Giovanni Peri, and Vasil Yasenov, "The Labor Market Effects of Mexican Repatriations: Evidence from Longitudinal Data in the 1930s," Technical Report, Dept. of Economics, University of California Davis 2020.

Markusen, James R., "Factor movements and commodity trade as complements," *Journal of International Economics*, 1983, *14* (3), 341–356.

Mayda, Anna Maria, Christopher Robert Parsons, Hannah Pham, and Pierre-Louis Vézina, "Refugees and foreign direct investment: Quasi-experimental evidence from US resettlements," CEPR Discussion Paper No. DP14242 2019.

MPC, "Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, International: Version 7.3 [dataset], Minnesota Population Center," Minneapolis, MN: IPUMS, 2020 2020.

Rauch, James E., "Networks versus markets in international trade," *Journal of International Economics*, 1999, *48* (1), 7–35.

Ruggles, Steven, Sarah Flood, Sophia Foster, Ronald Goeken, Jose Pacas, Megan Schouweiler, and Matthew Sobek, "IPUMS USA: Version 11.0 [dataset]," Minneapolis, MN: IPUMS 2021.

Sequeira, Sandra, Nathan Nunn, and Nancy Qian, "Immigrants and the Making of America," *Review of Economic Studies*, 03 2019, *87* (1), 382–419.

Tabellini, Marco, "Gifts of the Immigrants, Woes of the Natives: Lessons from the Age of Mass Migration," *The Review of Economic Studies*, 05 2019, *87* (1), 454–486.

UNDESA, *World Economic and Social Survey 2004: International Migration*, New York: United Nations, 2004.

Williamson, Jeffrey G, "Poverty Traps, Distance, and Diversity: The Migration Connection," Working Paper 12549, National Bureau of Economic Research October 2006.

__ , "World migration in historical perspective: Four big issues," in Barry R Chiswick and Paul W Miller, eds., *Handbook of the Economics of International Migration*, Vol. 1, Elsevier, 2015, pp. 89–101.